
FUNCTIONAL ANALYSIS Spring 2003

SOLUTIONS TO SOME PROBLEMS

Warning: These solutions may contain errors!!

PREPARED BY SULEYMAN ULUSOY

PROBLEM 1. Prove that a necessary and sufficient condition that the metric space (X, d) be complete is that every nested sequence of nonempty closed sets $(F_i)_{i=1}^{\infty}$ with diameters tending to 0, has a nonempty intersection:

$$\bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} F_i \neq \emptyset.$$

SOLUTION.

(\implies): Suppose first that (X, d) is complete. We shall show that the above condition is satisfied under this assumption. Suppose that (F_i) ($i=1,2,\dots$) is a nested sequence of nonempty closed sets such that $\text{diam}(F_i) := \sup_{a,b \in F_i} d(a, b) \rightarrow 0$. By selecting a point $x_n \in F_n$ for each $n = 1, 2, \dots$, we can generate a sequence (x_n) . This sequence must be Cauchy sequence, because, assuming $m > n$, we have $d(x_m, x_n) \leq \text{diam}(F_n)$, which tends to 0. Since (X, d) is complete, (x_n) must have a limit x . Now, for any given m , we have a sequence of points $\{x_m, x_{m+1}, \dots\} \subset F_m$. By this we have, $x \in \text{closure}(F_m) = F_m, \forall m$. Hence, $x \in \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} F_i$.

(\impliedby): Conversely, suppose that the given condition is satisfied and let (x_n) be a Cauchy sequence. Letting $H_n = \{x_n, x_{n+1}, \dots\}$, we can say that, since (x_n) is a Cauchy sequence, $\text{diam}(H_n) \rightarrow 0$. It is also true that $\text{diam}(\text{closure}(H_n)) \rightarrow 0$. Further, since

$$H_{n+1} \subset H_n \implies \text{closure}(H_{n+1}) \subset \text{closure}(H_n),$$

we see that $(\text{closure}(H_n))$ is a closed, nested sequence of nonempty sets in X , whose diameters tend to 0. By the hypothesis, we can conclude the existence of an x such that

$$x \in \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} \text{closure}(H_i).$$

Therefore, since $d(x_n, x) \leq \text{diam}(\text{closure}(H_n)) \rightarrow 0$, we see that $x_n \rightarrow x$.

PROBLEM 2. Let f be a continuous function such that $f : X \rightarrow Y$ where X and Y are metric spaces. Suppose A is a compact subset of X , prove that $f(A)$ is a compact subset of Y .

SOLUTION. Let (G_α) be a collection of open sets in Y such that

$$f(A) \subset \bigcup_{\alpha} G_{\alpha}.$$

Now we have,

$$A \subset f^{-1}(f(A)) \subset f^{-1}\left(\bigcup_{\alpha} G_{\alpha}\right) = \bigcup_{\alpha} f^{-1}(G_{\alpha}).$$

Since f is continuous each of the $f^{-1}(G_\alpha)$ are open sets. Thus, the family $(f^{-1}(G_\alpha))$ is an open covering for A . But by assumption A is compact, so there exist G_1, G_2, \dots, G_n such that

$$A \subset \bigcup_{i=1}^n f^{-1}(G_i),$$

which implies

$$f(A) \subset \bigcup_{i=1}^n f(f^{-1}(G_i)) \subset \bigcup_{i=1}^n G_i.$$

We have succeeded in selecting a finite subcovering from the original open covering for $f(A)$, and that shows $f(A)$ is compact.

PROBLEM 3. We know that if (X, d) is a metric space. Then $A \subset X$ is compact only if A is closed and bounded. In R^n we know that the converse is also true which is precisely the statement of the Heine-Borel Theorem. Give a counterexample to show that the converse is not necessarily true if we have an arbitrary metric space.

SOLUTION. Suppose X is any infinite set and the trivial metric d is assigned to it. For $\epsilon < \frac{1}{2}$ we have

$$S_{\epsilon}(x) = \{x\} \subset \{x\}$$

from which we conclude that even one-point sets in this metric space are open sets. X is itself bounded set as the distance between any two points is at most 1 and even this space is complete(exercise!). Since X is the whole space X is also closed. Now if we consider the following open covering of X ,

$$X \subset \bigcup_{x \in X} \{x\}.$$

It is clear that no finite subcovering can be chosen from this covering, so X is not compact though it is closed and bounded.

PROBLEM 4. For each n let $f_n : R \rightarrow R$ be a differentiable function. Suppose also that for each n and x we have $|f'_n| \leq 1$. Show that if for all x $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x) = g(x)$ then $g : R \rightarrow R$ is a continuous function.

SOLUTION. Fix $\epsilon > 0$. For real numbers $a < b$, we can choose n so large that $|f_n(a) - g(a)| < \epsilon$ and $|f_n(b) - g(b)| < \epsilon$. Then by the Mean Value Theorem, for $a < \xi < b$, we have the following estimate:

$$|g(a) - g(b)| \leq |g(a) - f_n(a)| + |f_n(a) - f_n(b)| + |f_n(b) - g(b)| < 2\epsilon + |f'_n(\xi)||b - a|.$$

Since $\epsilon > 0$ is arbitrary, the above estimate implies, $|g(a) - g(b)| \leq |b - a|$ and this shows that g is continuous.

PROBLEM 5. Let $f_n : [0, 1] \rightarrow [0, \infty)$ be continuous for $n = 1, 2, \dots$. Suppose

$$(*) f_1(x) \geq f_2(x) \geq f_3 \geq \dots$$

for $x \in [0, 1]$ and let $f(x) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x)$, $M = \sup_{x \in [0, 1]} f(x)$.

a.) Show that there exists $t \in [0, 1]$ such that $f(t) = M$.

b.) Does the conclusion remain valid if we replace the condition (*) by the following condition? *Suppose there exists n_x such that $f_n(x) \geq f_{n+1}(x)$ for all $x \in [0, 1]$ and $n > n_x$.*

SOLUTION.

a.) For $\epsilon > 0$, define $S_\epsilon = \{x \in [0, 1] : f(x) \geq M - \epsilon\}$. To have $f(x) \geq M - \epsilon$ the necessary and sufficient condition is to have $f_n(x) \geq M - \epsilon$ for all n . Hence we have $S_\epsilon = \bigcap_{n \geq 1} f_n^{-1}([M - \epsilon, \infty))$. Note that S_ϵ is nonempty and closed set for any ϵ . For finite number of positive numbers ϵ_i , $\bigcap_i S_{\epsilon_i} = S_{\min \epsilon_i} \neq \emptyset$. Since $[0, 1]$ is compact $\bigcap_\epsilon S_\epsilon \neq \emptyset$. Suppose $t \in \bigcap_\epsilon S_\epsilon$. Then we have, $M - \epsilon \leq f(t) \leq M$. Since $\epsilon > 0$ is arbitrary, $f(t) = M$.

b.) The conclusion does not remain valid if the condition (*) is replaced by *Suppose there exists n_x such that $f_n(x) \geq f_{n+1}(x)$ for all $x \in [0, 1]$ and $n > n_x$.* For a counter example consider $f_n(x) = \min\{nx, 1 - x\}$.

PROBLEM 6. Let (f_n) be a nondecreasing sequence of functions from $[0, 1]$ to $[0, 1]$. Suppose $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x) = f(x)$ and suppose also that f is continuous. Prove that $f_n \rightarrow f$ uniformly.

SOLUTION. Since $[0, 1]$ is compact and f is continuous on $[0, 1]$, f is uniformly continuous. Fix $\epsilon > 0$. Then there is a $\delta > 0$ such that, whenever $|x - y| < \delta$ we have $|f(x) - f(y)| < \epsilon$. Choose a natural number N such that $\frac{1}{N} < \delta$. Then for $0 \leq k \leq N$ let $\xi_k = \frac{k}{N}$ and divide $[0, 1]$ into subintervals of the form $[\xi_{k-1}, \xi_k]$. Since, $f_n(x) \rightarrow f$ pointwise, we can find $M > 0$, by taking maximum over the finite (ξ_k) , so that $|f_n(\xi_k) - f(\xi_k)| < \epsilon$ whenever $n \geq M$. Since (f_n) is a nondecreasing sequence of functions for $x \in [\xi_{k-1}, \xi_k]$ we have,

$$f(\xi_{k-1}) - \epsilon < f_n(x) < f(\xi_{k-1}) + 2\epsilon$$

which is equivalent to $|f_n(x) - f(\xi_{k-1})| < 2\epsilon$. Thus, we have the following estimate,

$$|f_n(x) - f(x)| \leq |f_n(x) - f(\xi_{k-1})| + |f(\xi_{k-1}) - f(x)| < 3\epsilon.$$

Since the above inequality does not depend on the particular point, we have the uniform convergence of f_n to f .

PROBLEM 7. Suppose $f : R^n \rightarrow R^m$ satisfies following properties.

- (i) For all compact subsets K of R^n , $f(K)$ is also compact.
 - (ii) For decreasing sequence (K_n) of compact subsets of R^n one has $f(\cap_n K_n) = \cap_n f(K_n)$.
- Show that f is a continuous function on R^n .

SOLUTION. Pick $\epsilon > 0$ and $x \in R^n$. Let B be an open ball of radius ϵ and centered at $f(x)$ and for all n let K_n be the closed ball of radius $\frac{1}{n}$ centered at x . By (ii) we have $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} f(K_n) = \{f(x)\}$. For all $n = 1, 2, \dots$, the sets $(R^n - B) \cap f(K_n)$ are compact and these sets form a decreasing sequence. By the previous equality their intersection is the empty set. Hence, there exists an n_0 so that $(R^n - B) \cap f(K_{n_0}) = \emptyset$. From this we get, when $|y - x| < \frac{1}{n_0}$ then $|f(y) - f(x)| < \epsilon$. And this shows that f is continuous at x . Since x was arbitrary, f is continuous on R^n .

PROBLEM 8. Suppose X, Y are metric spaces and $f : X \rightarrow Y$ is a continuous function. For all n let K_n be nonempty compact sets such that $K_{n+1} \subset K_n$ and let $K = \cap K_n$. Show that $f(K) = \cap f(K_n)$.

SOLUTION. Since $f(K) \subset f(K_n)$ for all n , we have $f(K) \subset \cap f(K_n)$. Now, let $y \in \cap f(K_n)$. Then, $f^{-1}(\{y\}) \cap K_n$ is non-empty and compact. Also, since for any n ,

$$f^{-1}(\{y\}) \cap K_{n+1} \subset f^{-1}(\{y\}) \cap K_n$$

the set

$$\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} (f^{-1}(\{y\}) \cap K_n) = f^{-1}(\{y\}) \cap K$$

is non-empty, so $y \in f(K)$.

PROBLEM 9. Show that every orthonormal sequence in an infinite-dimensional Hilbert space converges weakly to 0.

SOLUTION. Let (x_j) be an orthonormal sequence in a Hilbert space H . We need to show that $\langle f, x_j \rangle \rightarrow 0$ for all $f \in H^*$. By Riesz representation theorem that is same as showing $\langle x_j, y \rangle \rightarrow 0$ for all $y \in H$. This follows from the Bessel's inequality

$$\sum_j |\langle x_j, y \rangle|^2 \leq \|y\|^2 < \infty.$$

PROBLEM 10. Let X be a topological space, Y a Hausdorff space, and f, g continuous functions from X to Y .

- a.) Show that $\{x : f(x) = g(x)\}$ is closed.
 b.) Show that if $f = g$ on a dense subset of X , then $f = g$ on all of X .

SOLUTION.

- a.) We show that $\{x : f(x) \neq g(x)\}$ is open. Pick any x with $f(x) \neq g(x)$. Since Y is Hausdorff, we can find disjoint open sets U, V with $f(x) \in U$ and $g(x) \in V$. By continuity, $f^{-1}(U)$ and $g^{-1}(V)$ are open sets in X and both contain x , so $O = f^{-1}(U) \cap g^{-1}(V)$ is an open set around x . For any $y \in O$, $f(y) \in U$ and $g(y) \in V$ so $f(y) \neq g(y)$.
 b.) The set where $f = g$ is closed. If $f = g$ on any set A , then $f = g$ on closure of A , since the closure of A is the smallest closed set which contains A . "Dense" means that the closure is all of X .

PROBLEM 11. Suppose (f_n) is a sequence of continuous functions such that $f_n : [0, 1] \rightarrow R$ and as $n, m \rightarrow \infty$,

$$\int_0^1 (f_n(x) - f_m(x))^2 dx \rightarrow 0.$$

Suppose also that $K : [0, 1] \times [0, 1] \rightarrow R$ is continuous. Define $g_n : [0, 1] \rightarrow R$ by

$$g_n = \int_0^1 K(x, y) f_n(y) dy.$$

Show that (g_n) is uniformly convergent sequence.

SOLUTION. First, let us show that the sequence (g_n) is Cauchy in the supremum norm.

$$\begin{aligned} |g_n(x) - g_m(x)| &\leq \int_0^1 |K(x, y)| |f_n(y) - f_m(y)| dy \\ &\leq \left(\int_0^1 |K(x, y)|^2 dy \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \left(\int_0^1 |f_n(y) - f_m(y)|^2 dy \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \end{aligned}$$

implies that

$$\sup_{x \in [0, 1]} |g_n(x) - g_m(x)| \leq \sup_{x \in [0, 1]} \left(\int_0^1 |K(x, y)|^2 dy \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \left(\int_0^1 |f_n(y) - f_m(y)|^2 dy \right)^{\frac{1}{2}}.$$

Since K is continuous it is integrable and $M = \sup_{x, y \in [0, 1]} |K(x, y)|$ exists and this gives,

$$\|g_n(x) - g_m(x)\|_{\infty} \leq M \left(\int_0^1 |f_n(x) - f_m(x)|^2 dy \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \rightarrow 0$$

so, (g_n) is a Cauchy sequence in the supremum norm. But, we know that $C[0, 1]$ is complete under this norm, so the sequence (g_n) converges under this norm which is equivalent to converging uniformly.

PROBLEM 12. Let C denote the space of all bounded continuous functions on the real line R equipped with the supremum norm. Let S be the subspace of C consisting of functions f such that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(x)$$

exists.

a.) Is S a closed linear subspace of C ?

b.) Show that there is a bounded linear functional L on C so that

$$L(f) = \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x)$$

for all $f \in S$.

c.) Is there a bounded Borel measure μ so that $L(f) = \int_R f d\mu$ for all $f \in C$?

SOLUTION.

a.) Given $\epsilon > 0$, $\sup_{t \in R} |f_n(t) - f(t)| = \|f_n - f\|_\infty < \epsilon/3$ we need to decide whether or not $f \in S$.

Claim: $f \in S$ i.e. $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(x)$ exists. Suppose not, then for all $\delta > 0$, there is an $\epsilon_0 > 0$ such that $|x - y| < \delta$ but $|f(x) - f(y)| \geq \epsilon_0$. Now, we are given $\|f_n - f\|_\infty < \epsilon/3 \Leftrightarrow \sup_{t \in R} |f_n(t) - f(t)| < \epsilon/3$. But then we have $|f_n(x) - f(x)| < \epsilon/3$ and $|f_n(y) - f(y)| < \epsilon/3$. This yields,

$$|f(x) - f(y)| < |f(x) - f_n(x)| + |f_n(y) - f(y)| + |f_n(x) - f_n(y)| < \epsilon_0/3 + \epsilon_0/3 + \epsilon_0/3 \\ \Rightarrow |f(x) - f(y)| < \epsilon_0, \text{ which gives us a contradiction. Thus, } S \text{ is a closed linear subspace.}$$

b.) We will use Hahn-Banach Theorem to show the existence of L on C . For this, we need to find a sublinear functional p on C such that $\rho_0(f) \leq p(f)$ for all $f \in S$. Define,

$$p(f) = \begin{cases} \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x) & \text{if } f \in S \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

then, $p(f + g) = \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} (f + g) = p(f) + p(g)$ if $f, g \in S$. and $p(f + g) = 0 = p(f) + p(g)$ if $f, g \notin S$. Also, $p(af) = a \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x) = ap(f)$ if $f \in S$ and $p(af) = 0 = ap(f)$ if $f \notin S$.

So, p is indeed a sublinear functional on C such that $\rho_0(f) = \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x) \leq p(f)$ for all $f \in S$. Therefore, by the Hahn Banach Theorem, there is a linear functional L on C such that $L(f) \leq p(y)$ for all $f \in C$ and $L(f) = \rho_0(f) = \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x)$ if $f \in S$.

c.) We claim that there is no such Borel measure. Let us suppose there is one. Then on the left hand side we will have $\lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x)$ which is translation invariant i.e. $\lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x) = \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} f(x + a)$ for all $a \in R$. But, the only measure which is translation invariant is the Lebesgue measure, which is not bounded. So, there is no such bounded Borel measure.

PROBLEM 13. Let X be a normed linear space. Show that if S is an open subspace of X , then $S = X$.

SOLUTION. Let S be an open subspace of X . Since S is open and $0 \in S$, there exists $r > 0$ such that $B(0, r) \subset S$. Let $x \in X$. Fix any $R > \frac{1}{r}\|x\|$, and set $y = \frac{1}{R}x$. Then, $\|y\| = \frac{1}{R}\|x\| < r$, so $y \in B(0, r) \subset S$. Since S is closed under scalar multiplication, we conclude that $x = Ry \in S$. Thus, we have shown $X \subseteq S$ and the other inclusion is clear so that we have $X = S$.

PROBLEM 14. Suppose that A and K are closed subsets of an additive topological group G , prove that if K is compact then $A + K$ is closed.

SOLUTION. Let $p \in \overline{A + K}$. For each neighborhood U of p , let $K_U = \{k : k \in K, k \in U - A\}$. Since $p \in \overline{A + K}$, each K_U is non-empty. It is clear that if $U_1 \subseteq U_2$, then $K_{U_1} \subseteq K_{U_2}$. It follows that the closed sets $\overline{K_U}$ have the finite intersection property. So their intersection is non-empty. Now let $k_0 \in K = \bigcap \overline{K_U}$. Thus, if N is any neighborhood of the identity,

$$(N + k_0) \cap (N + p - A) \neq \emptyset.$$

This means that $(N - N + k_0) \cap (p - A) \neq \emptyset$. If M is any neighborhood of the identity, there is a neighborhood N of the identity such that $N - N \subseteq M$. Thus, any neighborhood of k_0 intersects $p - A$. Since A is closed, $p - A$, and thus $p \in A + k_0 \subseteq A + K$.

PROBLEM 15. Let X and Y be normed vector spaces, and let $L : X \rightarrow Y$ be linear and bounded.

a.) Show that $N(L) = \{x \in X : L(x) = 0\}$ is a closed subspace of X .

b.) Now let $X = \mathbb{C}$, the set of complex numbers. Show that $R(L) = \{L(x) : x \in \mathbb{C}\}$ is a closed subspace of Y . Hint: Every vector in \mathbb{C} is a scalar multiple of 1.

SOLUTION.

a.) Let $x, y \in N(L)$ and $a, b \in F$, then $L(ax + by) = aL(x) + bL(y) = 0$, so $ax + by \in N(L)$. Thus, $N(L)$ is a subspace.

Suppose that x is a limit point of $N(L)$. Then there exists $x_n \in N(L)$ such that $x_n \rightarrow x$. But L is continuous, so $0 = L(x_n) = L(x)$, so $x \in N(L)$.

b.) If $p = L(x), q = L(y) \in R(L)$ and $a, b \in F$, then $ap + bq = aL(x) + bL(y) = L(ax + by) \in R(L)$. Thus, $R(L)$ is a subspace.

Suppose that y is a limit point of Y . Then, there exists $y_n = L(x_n) \in R(L)$ such that $y_n \rightarrow y$. We have $x_n \in C$ and L is linear, so $L(x_n) = x_n L(1)$. If $L(1) = 0$ then $R(L) = \{0\}$ and we are done. If $L(1) \neq 0$, then

$$\|y_n - y_m\| = \|L(x_n) - L(x_m)\| = \|(x_n - x_m)L(1)\| = |x_n - x_m| \cdot \|L(1)\|.$$

Since $\|L(1)\|$ is a fixed constant and $\{y_n\}$ is a Cauchy sequence in Y , we conclude that $\{x_n\}$ is a Cauchy sequence of scalars in C , and since L is continuous, this implies $y_n = L(x_n) \rightarrow L(x)$. Since limits are unique, we have $y = L(x) \in R(L)$.

PROBLEM 16. Define $L : l^2 \rightarrow l^2$ by $L(x_1, x_2, \dots) = (x_2, x_3, \dots)$. Prove that L is bounded and find $\|L\|$. Is L injective?

SOLUTION. Let $x = (x_1, x_2, \dots) \in l^2$, then

$$\|L(x)\|_2^2 = \sum_{k=2}^{\infty} |x_k|^2 \leq \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} |x_k|^2 = \|x\|_2^2.$$

Hence, L is bounded, and

$$\|L\| = \sup_{\|x\|_2=1} \|L(x)\|_2 \leq \sup_{\|x\|_2=1} \|x\|_2 = 1.$$

On the other hand, since $e = (0, 1, 0, \dots)$ and $L(e) = (1, 0, 0, \dots)$ are both unit vectors, we have $\|L\| \geq 1$. Therefore, $\|L\| = 1$. L is not injective since $L(1, 0, 0, \dots) = L(0, 0, 0, \dots)$.

PROBLEM 17. Let X be a normed space, and suppose that $x_n \rightarrow x \in X$. Show that there exists a subsequence (x_{n_k}) such that

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \|x - x_{n_k}\| < \infty.$$

SOLUTION. We are given that $\|x - x_n\| \rightarrow 0$. There exists, N_1 such that $\|x - x_n\| < \frac{1}{2}$ for $n \geq N_1$. Let $n_1 = N_1$. There exists an N_2 such that $\|x - x_n\| < \frac{1}{2^2}$ for $n \geq N_2$. Choose any $n_2 > n_1, N_2$. There exists an N_3 such that $\|x - x_n\| < \frac{1}{2^3}$ for $n \geq N_3$. Choose any $n_3 > n_2, N_3$. Continuing in this fashion, we obtain $n_1 < n_2 < n_3 < \dots$ in such a way that

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \|x - x_{n_k}\| \leq \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{2^k} < \infty.$$