

## HOMEWORK 4, DUE THURSDAY FEBRUARY 6

**Problem 1, (5 points):** Please do Problem 2.2.39 in Heil.

**Solution:** Fix  $\alpha < 1$  and suppose that there is no cube with  $|E \cap Q|_e \geq \alpha|Q|$ . Hence for every cube we have that  $|E \cap Q|_e < \alpha|Q|$ . For any  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a countable collection of cubes  $Q_k$  such that  $E \subset \cup_k Q_k$  and such that

$$\sum_k |Q_k| \leq |E|_e + \varepsilon .$$

This follows from the definition of the exterior measure. We may assume that  $E \cap Q_k \neq \emptyset$  because otherwise we could drop it from the sum while preserving the above inequality. By assumption

$$\alpha \sum_k |Q_k| > \sum_k |E \cap Q_k|_e$$

and by subadditivity

$$\sum_k |E \cap Q_k|_e \geq |E|_e .$$

Hence

$$\alpha(|E|_e + \varepsilon) \geq |E|_e$$

which, since  $\varepsilon$  can be chosen as small as we like and  $\alpha < 1$  is a contradiction.

**Problem 2, (5 points):** Please work Problem 2.3.17 in Heil.

**Solution:** Consider the sets  $E \setminus A_n$ . Since  $|E| < \infty$  and  $|A_n| \rightarrow |E|$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$  we find

$$|E \setminus A_n| \rightarrow 0$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . Hence there exists a subsequence  $n_k$  such that  $\sum_k |E \setminus A_{n_k}| < |E|$ . Now,

$$\cup_k (E \setminus A_{n_k}) = E \setminus (\cap_k A_{n_k}) .$$

and hence

$$|E \setminus (\cap_k A_{n_k})| + |\cap_k A_{n_k}| = |E| .$$

Therefore,

$$|\cap_k A_{n_k}| = |E| - |\cup_k (E \setminus A_{n_k})| \geq |E| - \sum_k |E \setminus A_{n_k}| > 0 ,$$

using subadditivity.

**Problem 3, (7 points):** Please work Problem 2.3.18 in Heil.

**Solution:** If  $E$  is measurable then

$$|Q| = |Q \cap E|_e + |Q \setminus E|_e$$

using Caratheodory's criterion. Conversely, suppose the above equation holds for every box  $Q$ . Let  $A$  be an arbitrary set. By subadditivity of the exterior measure

$$|A|_e \leq |A \cap E|_e + |A \setminus E|_e .$$

Pick  $\varepsilon > 0$ . There exists a countable collection of boxes such that  $A \subset \cup_k Q_k$  and

$$|A|_e \geq \sum_k |Q_k| - \varepsilon = \sum_k |Q_k \setminus E| + |Q_k \cap E| - \varepsilon .$$

and by countable subadditivity and monotonicity

$$|A \setminus E| \leq |(\cup_k Q_k) \setminus E| \leq \sum_k |Q_k \setminus E| ,$$

$$|A \cap E| \leq \sum_k |Q_k \cap E|$$

so that

$$|A|_e \geq |A \setminus E| + |A \cap E| - \varepsilon$$

which proves the claim because  $\varepsilon$  is arbitrary.

**Problem 4, (3 points):** Please work Problem 2.3.19 in Heil.

**Solution:** The function  $f(t) = |E \cap B_t|$  is increasing by monotonicity. Pick any increasing sequence  $t_k$  that converges to  $t$ . Then  $E \cap B_{t_k}$  is an increasing sequence of nested sets and

$$\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} |E \cap B_{t_k}| = |\cup_k E \cap B_{t_k}| = |E \cap B_t| .$$

So  $f(t)$  is continuous from the left. If  $t_k$  is any sequence decreasing towards  $t$  then

$$\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} f(t_k) = |\cap_k E \cap B_{t_k}| = f(t) .$$

Thus  $f$  is continuous on  $(0, \infty)$ . c) follows by taking  $t_k \rightarrow \infty$  and b) follows from  $f(t) \leq |B_t| \rightarrow 0$  as  $t \rightarrow 0$ . The last assumption implies that  $f(t)$  is bounded and any continuous monotone increasing function that is bounded is uniformly continuous.

**Problem 5, (5 points):** Please do problem 2.4.8 in Heil.

**Solution:** a) For any set  $E \subset \mathbb{R}^d$  there exists a  $G_\delta$  set  $G$  with  $E \subset G$  and  $|E|_e = |G|$ . Thus we have  $E_k \subset G_k$  and  $|E_k|_e = |G_k|$  for  $k = 1, 2, \dots$ . We do not know, however, whether the  $G_k$  are nested. Instead of  $G_k$  we consider for any  $m = 1, 2, \dots$

$$B_m := \cap_{k=m}^{\infty} G_k$$

We obviously have that  $B_m \subset B_{m+1}$ . Further, since  $E_m \subset E_k \subset G_k$  for all  $k \geq m$  we have that  $E_m \subset B_m$ . Thus, by continuity

$$|\cup_m B_m| = \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} |B_m|$$

and hence by monotonicity

$$|\cup_m E_m|_e \leq |\cup_m B_m| = \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} |B_m| \leq \liminf_{m \rightarrow \infty} |G_m| = \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} |E_m|_e$$

Hence

$$|\cup_m E_m|_e \leq \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} |E_m|_e$$

By monotonicity

$$|\cup_m E_m|_e \geq |E_k|_e$$

for all  $k = 1, 2, \dots$  and hence

$$|\cup_m E_m|_e \geq \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} |E_m|_e .$$

b) Recall the non-measurable sets we constructed in class. There were countably many congruent subsets of the circle of circumference 1. Call them  $M_k$ . They had the property that  $M_k \cap M_\ell = \emptyset$  for  $k \neq \ell$  and  $\cup_k M_k = C$  the circle. Consider the sets  $B_m = \cup_{k=m}^{\infty} M_k$ . We have that  $B_1 \supset B_2 \supset B_3 \cdots$  which are nested. Each set has finite exterior measure because it is a subset of  $C$ . Further

$$\bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} B_m = \emptyset$$

because it consists precisely of the points that are in infinitely of the sets  $M_k$  which are disjoint. The sets  $M_k$  all have the same exterior measure, since they are congruent. Call this number  $K$ . This number cannot be zero since by subadditivity

$$1 = |C| \leq \sum_k |M_k|_e .$$

Hence

$$|B_m|_e \geq |M_m|_e = K$$

and

$$\liminf_{m \rightarrow \infty} |B_m|_e \geq K$$

whereas

$$|\bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} B_m|_e = 0 .$$